

Franklin Township Historic Preservation Advisory Commission
Minutes of the Regular Monthly Meeting
August 5, 2014

Call to Order

The meeting was called to order by Chairman Andrew Burian at 7:30 p.m. in accordance with the Open Public Meeting Law of 1975.

Attendance

Members—Jean Ambrose Andrew Burian, Anthony Ganim, Susan Goldey, Tom Gale, Joanne Kaiser, Barbara Lawrence, Bob LaCorte, Barbara ten Broeke

Alternate—Nancy Hohnstine

Staff—Vince Dominach

Council Member--Ted Chase(7:40)

Absent

Historian—Bob Mettler

Guests

Frank S. Aiello (Visitor/Observing)

Nicholas Stewart (1135 Easton Ave.)

Kathryn Kopp, Esq. (Monmouth Real Estate & Somerset Volunteer and Rescue)

Peter Richardson (Rutgers Prep, 1345 Easton Ave.)

Chris Nuhfer (Rutgers Prep/Remtek)

Franklin Mejia (41 Laurel Ave.)

George T. Luck, Jr. (7 Laurel Ave.)

Mark Edwards (5 Union Ave.)

Matt Wie (1319 Canal Rd.)

Eric Hambrecht (Stage House Tavern)

Zach & Joann Lichtmann (37 Franklin)

Ann & Abram Suydam (Re: Judy Shaw)

Review Actions

Formal

1. Review of the application for Certificate of Appropriateness by George T. and Carol A. Luck, Jr., 7 Laurel Avenue, Kingston, NJ 08528 for replacement of posts, columns and rails on porch. Block 4, Lot 17 Zoned R-10-H, located within the Kingston Historic District. #14-00027

Mr. George Luck presented photographs of the house, drawings of the proposed railing, post and column replacement, and product specification sheets. Mr. Luck explained that he plans to replace the existing wood system with a product that will require less maintenance, and still have the appearance of wood. He stated that the balusters will be of the same dimensions as the existing ones. Barbara Lawrence stated that replacement with wood would be more appropriate. She recommended that the railing style be the one labeled "Classic II" on the product spec sheet. There was discussion regarding the post that is scribed into the siding on the building and that it may have to remain in place if it is serviceable.

There was no discussion from the public on this application.

A motion was made and seconded (Lawrence, LaCorte) and passed unanimously to approve the application as submitted with the conditions that: 1) the columns are fiberglass and Ionic style, 2) that the railings are the "Classic II" style on the spec sheet, and 3) the post scribed to the siding is the same in appearance as the existing post.

2. Review of the application for Certificate of Appropriateness by Matthew Wie and Elizabeth Kim for construction of new garage at 1319 Canal Road, Princeton, NJ. Block 9 Lot 9.06, Zoned CP, located within the Delaware and Raritan Canal Historic District. #14-00024

Matthew Wie and Elizabeth Kim presented elevation drawings of the proposed 26' x 36.5' garage and photographs of the house, including a view of the house from the proposed site of the garage. Mr. Wie explained that the garage was designed to be consistent with the house in style, scale and materials. The garage will have front gables, two sets of double doors with 6 lights each, wood clapboard, skylights instead of dormers, and a fiberglass shingle roof that resembles the roofing on the house. The garage stands parallel to the road, but is largely obscured by the house. Andrew Burian recommended that gutters be added to the plans and that they are half round with round leaders.

There was no discussion from the public on this application.

A motion was made and seconded (LaCorte, Ambrose) and passed unanimously to approve the application as submitted with the condition that if gutters are installed, that they are Dutch style gutters.

3. Review of the application for Certificate of Appropriateness by Zachary and Joann Lichtmann for repair and modification of garage at 37 Franklin Street, Somerset, NJ 08873. Block 69 Lot 14 Zoned R-10-H, located within the East Millstone Historic District. #14-0040021

Zachary and Joann Lichtmann presented a site plan, drawings of the proposed repairs and photographs of the condition of the wood in the garage. Mr. Lichtmann stated that he wished to replace the existing wood siding with wood grain vinyl siding and change the pitch of the roof from 6:12 to 12:12. The doors will be replaced with unpainted doors without windows. He further stated that neighboring garages had vinyl siding and 12:12 pitch roofs. The Commission noted that the existing siding is Dutch lap style. Anthony Ganim informed the applicants that the existing novelty siding, while not available in big box stores, is available in lumber yards. Barbara Lawrence recommended that smooth, not wood grain, vinyl be used, as it would more closely resemble newly painted clapboard material. Sue Goldey recommended installing gutters during the renovation. It was noted that the garage is not visible from Franklin Street.

There was no discussion from the public on this application.

A motion was made and seconded (LaCorte, ten Broeke) and approved unanimously to approve the application with the condition that Dutch lap vinyl siding is installed with matching gutters.

4. Review of the application for Certificate of Appropriateness by Mark Edwards, 5 Union Street, Kingston, NJ, 08528 for replacement of existing roof with metal roof. Block 3 Lot 3 Zoned R-10-H, located within the Kingston Historic District. #14-00023

Mr. Edwards presented photographs of the house, of the garage already roofed with the proposed material and a spec sheet for the product. The original building was constructed in the 1870's and there are two additions. The applicant stated that he chose to replace the shingle roof with a corrugated metal roof because of its cost, durability, low environmental impact and the fact that it was appropriate to the period of the house. He cited the Kingston lock tenders' house and several buildings in Bucks County, PA as examples of houses of a similar period with metal roofs. The Commission noted that no other residences in the Village of Kingston had metal roofs. Tom Gale informed the applicant that it is his opinion that a standing seam metal roof is superior to a corrugated one because there are fewer punctures to the membrane. Nancy Hohnstine stated that she believed a vernacular historic house is "allowed" to acquire individual characteristics, such as a metal roof. It was noted that the applicant had not received a construction permit for the already re-roofed garage.

The Commission asked the applicant to amend the application to include the garage, and to return with a larger sample of the proposed material.

There was no discussion from the public on this application.

5. Review of the application for a Certificate of Appropriateness of Luis and Piedad Mejia for replacement of roof at 41 Laurel Avenue, Kingston, NJ. Block 5.02 Lot 149.01 Zoned R-10-H, located within the Kingston Historic District #14-00028

Mr. Franklin Mejia, son of the applicants, presented photographs of the house (including an aerial view), a written description of the project and product spec sheets for the proposed Timberline shingles. The age of the original house, to which, according to the applicant, a 20th century second story was added, was not determined. Tom Gale noted that the Kingston Historic District national register nomination indicated that that a slate roof existed. It was noted that because of the height of the house the roof is not visible from the street.

There was no public discussion on this application.

A motion was made and seconded (LaCorte, Goldey) and passed by a vote of 7:2 to approve the application as submitted.

6. Review of the application for Certificate of Appropriateness by Stage House, Inc., 1719 Amwell Road, Somerset, NJ 08873. Block 417.01 Lot 5.01 Zoned R-1-H, located within the Middlebush Historic District. #14-00026

Mr. Eric Hambrecht and Mr. Moishe Davideska presented a photograph of a 12' high sign that has been erected at the entrance to the driveway leading to the parking lot of the restaurant. The sign faces Amwell Road and Middlebush Village. Mr. Hambrecht stated that the restaurant has had a problem with patrons parking illegally in their parking lot, creating a fire hazard, and that he believed this sign was the best solution to the problem. Susan Goldey recommended that the sign be placed farther along in the driveway, closer to the actual parking area and out of view from the road. Patrons

would have the opportunity to turn around in the parking lot. Andrew Burian asked the applicants to return with a site plan and a design plan that indicates dimensions and materials. The applicants were granted 60 days to remove the sign.

There was no public discussion on this application.

7. Review of the application for Certificate of Appropriateness by Monmouth Real Estate and Investment Corporation & Trifoodarama, L.L.C, 3499 Route 9 North, Suite 3C, Freehold, NJ 07728/80 Main Street, West Orange, NJ 07052, for refurbishment of existing freestanding sign at 1135 Easton Avenue, Somerset, NJ 08873. Block 259 Lot 79.02 Zoned GB, located within the D&R Canal Historic District. #14-00025

Kathryn Kopp Esq., Attorney for the applicant and Nicholas Stewart, General Contractor, presented plans for the refurbishment of the monument sign at the 1135 Easton Avenue. A picture of the sign as is and a computer generated “after” photo were also provided. The refurbished sign will be the same dimensions as the existing sign, will be back lighted and on a timer.

There was no public discussion on this application.

A motion was made and seconded (Burian, Lawrence) and passed unanimously to approve the application as submitted.

8 Review of the application of Somerset Volunteer and Rescue Company No. 1. 20 Hollywood Avenue, Somerset, NJ 08873. Block 444- Lot 1 R-20, located within the Delaware and Raritan Canal Historic District. #14-00018

Kathryn Kopp, Esq. returned at the Commission’s request with more details about the 40’ x 50’ pole barn proposed to be erected on the parcel. A photograph of a similar structure was provided. The barn will have 3’ panels of metal cladding, sides and roof. There will be two garage doors on the south elevation. Samples of the material and colors were provided.

There was no discussion from the public on this application.

A motion to approve the application was made and seconded (Gale, LaCorte) and passed unanimously with the conditions that the roof will be corrugated ribbed metal and that the colors will be beige on the building, tan on the trim and dark brown on the roof. Furthermore, the applicant must submit additional samples for verification.

9. Review of the application for Certificate of Appropriateness by Remtek Services Inc., 204 Branchwood Court, Deptford, NJ 08906 for installation of silicone roofing system at Rutgers Preparatory School, 1345 Easton Avenue, Somerset, NJ 08873. Block 466 Lot 1.01 Zoned P and located within the Delaware and Raritan Canal Historic District. #14-00022

Peter Richardson, Director of Operations for Rutgers Prep and Chris Nuhfer of Remtek Services, Inc. presented an aerial photograph of the school with the buildings to be re-roofed indicated and product specs for the material to be used in the project. Various certifications for the provider were also included in the application. Mr. Richardson explained that the roofs on the rotunda and the

gymnasium were leaking and that vents needed to be installed. Mr. Nuhfer explained the process of installing one inch of silicone foam creating a membrane with a granular appearance. Virtually none of the product is visible from ground level.

A motion was made and seconded (Goldey, LaCorte) and approved unanimously to approve the application as submitted as there will be no negative impact on the D&R Canal Historic District.

Informal Review

Mr. Richardson asked for the Commission's opinion about a future window replacement project at Rutgers Prep. The project calls for replacing the existing windows in the gym with Kalwall, a translucent, impact resistant product. The appearance will be the same except for cross pieces that resemble muntins imbedded in the glass. Chairman Burian advised Mr. Richardson to select the correct facing and to bring a sample of the product when the application is presented.

Mr. Richardson also presented photos of replacement windows in another building on the campus that exhibited compliance with previous requests of the Commission, and expressed his desire to work closely with the Commission in the future.

New Business

Pleasant Plains School House

Work on the Pleasant Plains School house was started as part of a lead abatement project. Despite being part of the Historic resource inventory for the Township; the Historic Preservation Advisory Commission was not consulted prior to work and SHPO approval was not sought for the project. The Commission was only made aware of the project by happenstance of observing the work in progress. The Commission made observation of many key historic elements being destroyed or damaged as part of the work including, but limited to wood windows, exterior doors and interior bead board ceilings. After these items were observed on 8/4 the Commission alerted their administrative staff person, Vince Dominach.

During the August meeting Vince Dominach provide follow up to the Commissions 8/4 inquiry. He indicated that the original contract for the project was to include only lead abatement. He indicated that the Townships Engineering Department made the mistake of approving additional work that included installing vinyl windows in place of completing proper encapsulation or abatement of the existing wood windows. This was to be a no cost change order to the project. It was noted by Commission that by simply replacing the windows and not completing the original contract work the Contractor likely saved money. He further indicated to the Commission that the historic windows and doors, including windows stored in the building for future restoration had been discarded as part of the project.

In a means to establish the path to receiving the proper approvals for the current project Mr. Dominach asked the Commission to make a determination as to whether the building is eligible for listing as a local historic site or for listing on the State and National Registers of Historic Places. After a discussion period the Commission came to the consensus that, while the structure has local historic significance and is part of the historic resources of the Township that the building would not be eligible for State or National Registers because the building had been relocated from its original location. This determination would make SHPO approvals not be required for the project. Since there is only one other historic one room school houses in town and it is in private ownership, this building

represents an important part Franklin history that needed to be saved. As was evident by the expense and care taken to move it to its current location.

The Commission noted that the Township Historic Consultant made recommendations regarding the school house in his 2012 report which outlined immediate needs for the preservation of the structure. It was decided that the Township must make application to the Commission for the work that has recently been completed and for all future work. It was stressed that the Township and the Historic Preservation Advisory Commission must be consistent in how it treats owners and stewards of its historic resources. Due to the nature of the errors on this Township owned structure the Commission requested that the Township Manager attend an upcoming meeting to further discuss the issue. A motion was made and seconded (LaCorte, Ganim) and passed by a vote of 8:1 to advise the Township Engineering Department of the Commission's opinion regarding the Pleasant Plains school house and to have them make formal application for the work completed.

A motion was made and seconded and approved unanimously to table the remainder of the agenda until the next meeting. (Burian, Goldey)

Next Meeting Announcement

September 2, 2014

Adjournment

The meeting was adjourned at 10:35 p.m.

Copies

Robert Vornlocker, Township Manager
Ann Marie McCarthy, Township Clerk
Mark Healey, Director of Planning
Vincent Dominach, Senior Zoning Officer